

Masters Dissertation/  
Trabajo Fin de Máster

**GRAPHIC NOVELS AS  
MULTIMODAL TOOLS TO  
FOMENT PLURILITERACIES  
AND LEARNER MOTIVATION**

**Student: Craig, Lucas**

Supervisor: Dr. Yolanda Caballero Aceituno  
Department: English Philology

**July, 2022**

## INDEX

ABSTRACT.....	4
INTRODUCTION AND JUSTIFICATION.....	5
THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK .....	6
Graphic novels and Comics: What are They? Characteristics, differences and similarities. ....	6
Cases Applied: The multiplicity of themes and uses in schools.....	7
Use and Application for Literacy.....	8
CLIL: definition, uses and limitations. Importance of authentic materials. Introduction to multimodal materials.....	9
GRAPHIC NOVELS AND CLIL TOGETHER.....	13
Antecedents and effectiveness of graphic novels as a potential CLIL tool and literacy-fomenting tool.....	15
Usefulness and value under the CLIL spectrum. CLIL tools, materials and what makes one.....	19
OBJECTIVES AND HYPOTHESIS.....	25
General Objective.....	25
Specific Objectives.....	25
Hypothesis.....	25
METHODOLOGY. ....	26
Inclusion and Exclusion criteria.....	26
Process of Study Selection.....	27
RESULTS.....	29
Characteristics of the selected studies.....	30
DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS.....	36
Effectivity of graphic novels as a multimodal tool for pluriliteracies development.....	35
School as a first contact point and graphic novels as constant motivators.....	37
Possible Limitations .....	39

CONCLUSIONS.....	40
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	41

## **Abstract**

The development of literacy is a key point for success in education. For today's educational reality we see the importance of engaging with students in a holistic way, so that the effect of teaching and learning may generate stronger and long-lasting outcomes. The aim of this study is to take the timely presence of graphic novels as a creative and modern way to present content and language in a multimodal manner and analyse the development of pluriliteracies which today more than ever is seen as essential. The present study will attempt to find the correlations between these tools and how students engage with written works. The parameters applied define the limits to no more than 10 years from today and aiming specifically at the instruction of English as a second language. Taking all the findings and data obtained, the results show great promise to promote graphic novels as the future cornerstone for the classroom. Applications covering a plethora of topics and with diverse strategies show how they are a flexible and reliable tool.

## **Resumen**

El desarrollo de la alfabetización es un punto clave para el éxito en la educación. Para la realidad educativa actual, vemos la importancia de comprometerse con los estudiantes de una manera holística, de modo que el efecto de la enseñanza y el aprendizaje pueda generar un resultado más sólido y duradero también. El objetivo de este estudio es tomar la presencia puntual de las novelas gráficas como una forma creativa y moderna de presentar el contenido y el lenguaje de manera multimodal y analizar el desarrollo de las pluri-alfabetizaciones que hoy más que nunca se vislumbran como imprescindibles. El presente estudio intentará encontrar las correlaciones entre estas herramientas y cómo los estudiantes se relacionan con trabajos escritos. Tomando todos los hallazgos y datos obtenidos, los resultados muestran una gran promesa para promover las novelas gráficas como la futura piedra angular del aula. Las aplicaciones que cubren una gran cantidad de temas y con diversas estrategias muestran cómo son una herramienta flexible y confiable.

**Keywords:** graphic novels, CLIL, multimodal, motivation, literacy, pluriliteracies

## **Introduction**

For this Master's dissertation I wanted to analyse the effectiveness of the literary resources we call "Graphic Novels" and their possible implementation as a CLIL tool to motivate students in favour of strengthening their second language. These aspects have been widely researched for children and in primary settings as well as secondary educational spaces, but graphic novels present themselves as a timely and innovative option for the modern era of education, which so far remains to be applied worldwide in an efficient way.

As a secondary school teacher, I have seen a significant decrease in the amount of reading done by students, showing a lack of interest in general, and at least from my personal perspective, a massive waste of resources and culture from the learners' part. I want to investigate, through the analysis of previous applications of these works of literature in secondary settings, the effect it has on language use, such as fluency, vocabulary acquisition, communication skills, amongst others.

Regarding the points of interest with CLIL, it would be the connection and repercussions graphic novels have on students' interculturality, motivation, communication through genuine and natural English use. I am taking into consideration as well, that these works are an accessible, low cost and multidisciplinary tool that can be successfully applied in a number of contexts, varying levels of education and require a relatively low effort from the users.

## **Graphic Novels and Comics:**

### **What are They? Characteristics, differences and similarities.**

A graphic novel is typically understood to be an extended comic tale published in the format of a book, opposite to comics, which are more often than not published in individual numbers, which could later be published together in an integral format. Although many understand the word “novel” as referring to extensive works of fiction, the term "graphic novel" can include a broad spectrum of works covering nonfictional works, fantasy, historical retellings, biographies or anything between those categories. It is important to remember that "Graphic Novel" refers to a format, not a genre in itself. While in some aspects comparable to comic books in their use of sequential and progressive graphic arts to share an idea or develop a story, these novels are usually a unique number with complex plots that develop themselves in a single publication. While the term may be slightly divisive it is said to have been coined in 1964 by fan historian Richard Kyle, and was later popularised when Will Eisner included the term within his publication of “A Contract with God” in 1978. Notwithstanding, the term *and* the format it describes, had been in existence for many years already.

Nixon, (2019) retells the story of how comic strips evolved and created something new, first with comic books and then leading the way to graphic novels. While it was a somewhat turbulent era filled with ups and downs in the industry, comings and goings of publishers appearing and disappearing constantly, from the first strips to major works like Art Spiegelman’s (1980) “Maus”, Alan Moore’s (1989) “From Hell” or Bryan and Mary M. Talbot’s (2012) “Dotter of Her Father’s Eyes”, we can see how the art form developed itself allowing authors and artists to propose and bring forward a revolutionary way to present their ideas while simultaneously writing commendable works of literature.

The three works mentioned above are but the smallest sample of the variety, range and depth that one can find in the format. Not alien to criticism and censorship, graphic novels have always been a flagship of innovation, ranging

again from the underground culture to academically recognised work as is Talbot's (2007) "Alice in Sunderland", which earned him not only worldwide recognition but an honorary doctorate from the University of Sunderland for his exceptional contributions. This was not the first time something like this had happened, that a comic-format work received such recognition, but it so proves that "comics" have indeed achieved a level of respect by academic institutions which they have so clearly deserved for many decades.

Reading into the history of graphic novels and the current scene, one could say we are witnessing the appearance of a worldwide movement of authors who have seized the medium wholeheartedly and are making great efforts trying to turn it into a format where freedom and creativity may reign. The topics and themes covered in these novels are as eclectic as one can imagine and therefore present themselves as a multi-tool to be used in any educational environment and to promote literacy as well as an interest in culture, history or fiction.

It would be naïve to think it is only coincidental that in an era of multimedia and multisensorial stimuli, where people are accustomed to a constant pictorial bombardment, graphic novels are finally coming into their own while creating a mature and learned cultural environment. It has certainly been a rocky and winding road but the fruit of those gargantuan efforts we can harvest and enjoy today. The application of these works in learning environments has been active for years, but it is possible that its popularisation added to our unique modern realities is making this use far more frequent and changing the way teachers and students alike face texts and learning materials.

### **Cases Applied: The multiplicity of Themes and Uses in Schools.**

Graphic novels have been covering as diverse themes as we can find in the real world. Be it in a fictional or realistically depicted scenes and use of illustrations and language, they have always brought up topics which leave the door well open for further discussions. These works have been applied in a variety of places and scenarios, such as Schulte and Frederick's (2019) work into Black Panther from Marvel Comics, to take a deep look into how cultural nationalism is manifested in comic books. Topics such as collective agency, strength, stereotypes and the Black Power Movement come up and are analysed regarding how they were interpreted, navigated and presented by the creators, always taking into consideration the narrative and the visual elements of the work. This study surely opened up many topics for dialogue and debate.

Another example is Chattopadhyay's work from 2017, where with his heading he asks the question "Can comic-books influence consumer awareness and attitude towards rape victims and perpetrators in India?". This paper explores how comic book narratives may create alertness and whether they might influence attitudes regarding how society perceives people who have suffered and survived rape assaults, specifically in the context of India. Inspired by a true story of a gang rape in New Delhi, this study opens up and dives into a certainly complex issue, filled with cultural, societal and even religious elements which affect how the public treat this subject and the people involved. "The book uses Hindu mythology in its narrative to call for a change in existing belief systems about rape and rape victims" (Chattopadhyay, 2017, p.1) and shows interviews where people were also asked how they thought comic books and graphic novels should be used to generate changes in the social system. The data showed that comics can play a substantial part in generating a more aware audience, particularly amongst a young groups. Nevertheless, it was noted that attitudinal changes and deeper consciousness would require active and mindful participation from stakeholders. Still, graphic novels remained a viable option to reach a wide audience from different social strata and geographical locations.



Politics, violence, the role of women, equality, biographical works, adaptations of classics, reinterpretations, or even the treatment of abstract ideas or concepts are all included in what we consider graphic novels and comics. As a format which is steadily gaining ground, authors are also getting the confidence needed to take a step further and talk about the difficult topics and important matters that as human beings involve us all.

### ***Use and Application for Literacy.***

Both directly and indirectly this wide array of themes presents itself as an enormous tool for learning. For decades, although shyly even today, graphic novels haven't been used in the classroom to enable, encourage, motivate and promote literacy. Graphic novels require a different mindset and preparation to be able to exploit all they bring with them. Nevertheless, a quick revision of the literature shows us that in the last 10 years, they have been applied all around the world, to teach reading comprehension (Brenna, 2013; Cook 2016; Wong W.L. et. al., 2016), visual arts (Thomas, 2012), visual literacy (Lundy and Stephens, 2015), vocabulary acquisition (Başal, Aytan & Demir, 2016), reader motivation (Hargadon, 2018). Lastly, a point which is crucial to the development of this study and the future of education is multimodal literacy, researched by Serafini, (2013), Connors (2013), and Cook and Kirchoff (2017). So, as we can see, the use of the format is not at all limited to superficial dealings or the graphic arts and design. These novels, due to their rich and multifaceted conception enable teachers to adapt their course and themselves to a format that will encourage and motivate our students and promote the development of abundantly useful tools for the future.

**CLIL: definition, uses and limitations. Importance of authentic materials. Introduction to multimodal materials.** Having mentioned and introduced graphic novels as a multi-tool for rich and motivating teaching and learning experiences, inside the classroom but also for our roles in society as well, it seems inevitable to think about where would this tool be most applicable and better exploited. It is in the integrated teaching of content and language where we see the need and practical use of integrative elements. These would cover many fronts and enable teaching to build up and grow into something richer and more interesting and will mark and introduce our students to a lifelong process of inquiry and learning.

Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL), was defined by David Marsh (1994) as "... situations where subjects, or parts of subjects, are taught through a foreign language with dual-focused aims, namely the learning of content and the simultaneous learning of a foreign language." (In Biçaku, 2011, p.3822). Similarly defined, but with some interesting differences is Nikula et al.'s (2013) definition: "an educational approach in which a foreign language is used as the medium of instruction to teach content subjects for mainstream students." There are many ways in which CLIL is practically applied, and while a relatively new acronym, the methodology has been gestating for many years now. Despite its fashionable name and authors promoting its use, we need to define who is it actually for, what are its real benefits and applications, and of course mention its challenges.

To answer the question "who is CLIL for?", we have to acknowledge that CLIL can indeed work perfectly with students of any age. As long as the content of the course and the linguistic aims and objectives have been planned ahead and are aimed at the group's level then, despite some controversial moments and active opposition towards the method, from primary to university level CLIL has proven to be an efficient methodology as shown in works of authors like Bonnet, 2012; Coyle, 2010; Dalton-Puffer 2007; Dobson et al. 2010; Meyer, 2010; Merisuo-Storm, 2011, to mention a few.

Thus, which could be said to be CLIL's actual benefits? Teachers who actively teach with CLIL, see it as an effortless or genuine way to teach and learn. If we position ourselves as a student learning a topic which is being imparted in a foreign language, while it may seem double the workload, actually we have a situation where we are in fact doubly motivated. In these situations, we have a concrete reason to learn both parts, and as a real context is built around it, students will realise that to make the most of the content matter, the language becomes essential to continue learning.

The dual focus makes it two times interesting and challenging. Furthermore, as CLIL is focused as well on the content, the lessons take on another element or dimension which makes students face, act and react in a certain way which results in a big lead for their cognitive processes, especially for those who seem indifferent towards the learning of a new language. Nonetheless, CLIL will require an extra investment from learners as it encourages a more profound and conscientious process, needed for them to assimilate the new information. Since they are repeatedly exposed to similar language, because CLIL has the benefit of covering multiple subjects with one foreign language, the repetition of structures and functions, the exposure to the linguistic components is highly increased, therefore promoting a quick acquisition of the language.

CLIL's modern ways and creative vision will focus as well on a specific set of skills which are applicable in today's world more than ever. The ability to communicate soundly, engage in creative processes (mental and physical) while generating critical thought, all in a spirit of cooperation and collaboration are areas which are actually promoted by many international programmes such as the International Baccalaureate (I.B.) or International General Certificate of Secondary Education (IGCSE) exams. Unfortunately, these can sometimes fall short because of their limited year packages and lack of a whole school model. Far from being a perfect and simplistic method, CLIL comes with a complete set of challenges for all stakeholders. It all starts with the dual focus, which makes the teachers' task heavier and more complex. By being subject-focused, only-language teachers are in a position where they should develop some knowledge of other subjects to be able to teach effectively. That means, in

tandem with the content teachers, complementing and collaborating actively. This will entail careful structuring of classes, so that no part is left unattended and students can follow through easily. Material planning and/or production, to scaffold and pay close attention to both individual and group processes and progress will also be essential for the correct and coherent development.

When thinking about a practical application of CLIL in a classroom, we have to remember to have a strong structure. Not inflexible, but sturdy as to be able to manage all the components and ensure quality and motivating education. The first point would be to keep in mind that equal weightings are given to language and subject content. According to Coyle's (1999) 4Cs curriculum for a CLIL class to be successful it should be comprised of specific elements: Content, Communication, Cognition, and Culture. These are to be intertwined in every session to ensure engagement and full-range development. To understand how this would work, a short explanation for each follows.

- **Content:** This regards how knowledge progresses. Keeping in mind their general abilities and comprehension, always connected to the part of the unit/topic/project.
- **Communication:** The concrete application of the language as they simultaneously acquire and understand it.
- **Cognition:** Has to do with advancing in their abilities to think critically. All this while showing their capacity to connect concept construction with the linguistic part and overall understanding.
- **Culture:** to broaden inner and outer consciousness it is necessary to generate contact with different realities, compared or opposite points of view as well as with shared notions.

Even with these actively in play, CLIL will still have a strong reliance on a good scaffolding method, a strong framework to base and prepare lessons, and device activities which present an achievable challenge for our students. Here Bloom's Taxonomy (1956), which classifies the learning objectives and sets a grading system that range from what he calls "Lower Order Thinking Skills (LOTS)" and "Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS)", enters the scene. These

will help to remind ourselves of the ongoing processes in the classroom, the achievable and progressive evolution of our students. To get to this point, we need pertinent tactics and the correct tools to engage with the class. We cannot limit ourselves to the old ways of the textbook and standardisation of the teaching-learning dynamics. If we are considering new ways, we have to also count in the potential new elements to be applied with them.

### **Graphic Novels and CLIL Together**

Relevant studies which reflect the objective of this research will be mentioned next, to highlight some important points which will help to clarify the likely connection between graphic novels and CLIL. In 2011, Coyle carried out the ITALIC study which demonstrated the importance of classroom interactions in a CLIL environment (Coyle, 2011). By speaking up and therefore generating genuine and rich conversational and communicative situations, the result was of longer utterances, building language and building upon it, which also included the use of listening comprehension strategies. Of this, students gave their verdict and assured they had *fun* in the classes. This last point while seemingly trivial, is indeed an important element to factor in our CLIL analysis, even more so when focusing on motivation to learn. The general results obtained and the enjoyment from the participants can be related to the challenge proposed, their active engagement with the material, the activities and the dialogues carried out.

These exchanges, dialogues and connections between opposite realities and discourses, feed one of the crucial pillars of modern education. Intercultural interest and knowledge, a desire to learn, added to a change in attitude towards other languages and realities can be enhanced through CLIL. For all this, Braquier, (2013); Coyle, (2010); and Vujovic, (2011) all show us how a method can enrich the lives and prospects of our students, helping them develop deeper understanding towards intercultural experiences. In studies carried out by Merisuo-Storm (2011) and Dalton-Puffer (2007), confidence boosts in language learning have been seen in children, considering literacy skills, fluency, creativity and risk taking. From these we can see an explosive change

in student's experiences, inside and outside the classroom. Much depends on the specific situation and teacher's preparation, but the materials we use are key to enabling and shifting the reality of education.

This is when graphic novels can make their grand entrance. The role of materials in CLIL is critical: the method proposes a different usage and vision towards what happens before, during and after class. Therefore, we need to specify what kind of materials and situations we are considering here. In 2012, Peeter Mehisto presented a list of criteria essential for the creation of creating CLIL-specific learning materials which is presented below and later further developed upon.

1. Making the learning **intentions** (language, content, learning skills) and process **visible**.
2. Systematically fostering **academic language proficiency**.
3. Fostering learning **skills development** and **learner autonomy**.
4. Including self, peer and other types of formative **assessment**.
5. Helping create a **safe learning environment**.
6. Fostering **cooperative learning**.
7. Seeking ways of incorporating **authentic language and authentic language use**.
8. Fostering **critical thinking**.
9. Fostering **cognitive fluency** through **scaffolding** of a) content, b) language, c) learning skills development.
10. Helping to make **learning meaningful** (Mehisto, 2012, 21, 15-33).

As we see, these materials should be more than just a sheet of newspaper or article with "authentic language use". They need to be carefully chosen, if not self-made, to cover these criteria and ensure rich and deep processes. Some words have been highlighted above, as they will be the key elements to look for in the planning, choosing and implementation of materials, in our specific case, graphic novels. To understand and clearly see how they can be a perfect fit for

a CLIL lesson, a mention of different concrete applications in the classroom will be detailed below.

### **Antecedents and effectiveness of graphic novels as a potential CLIL tool and Literacy fomenting tool.**

Graphic Novels are what we could call multimodal tools for learning. Kress & Van Leeuwen (2001) define these devices as an “interplay between different representational modes, for instance, between images and written/spoken word” (p.20). They also stress that these representations “mediate the sociocultural ways in which these modes are combined in the communication process” (p.20). Today we find the learning environment to be a rich amalgam of events, themes and ways of doing, which makes the drawing of limits between written and oral tasks, interpretation of texts, observing and writing, a difficult task. Both teachers and learners are not only on the receiving end of the communication channels, as we are also creators of meanings and therefore “active participants in meaning-making communities and networks” (Lankshear & Knobel 2003).

This constant blending and differentiations, as well as the modernisation of our classroom and cognitive processes involved is a recurrent theme of the 21<sup>st</sup> century as shown in early studies like Gee’s (2003) regarding video games. Studies like this on have helped to define the relationship between learning and literacy, and as with video games, graphic novels carry the idea of *new* literacies. According to Gee (2003), visual symbols and signs bear equal weight as language in its written or oral forms. With this statement, he introduces visual literacy as a novel and defining element to our perceptions towards education. The cohesive and symbiotic relationship between images and words is not alien to us (textbooks, web pages, newspapers, etc.) but it is in graphic novels where this conjunction happens in a unique and extremely coherent way. The pictures or the text are not independent of each other, for there is as much to read in the words as there is in the drawn lines and shapes. This simple difference already breaks the idea of how textbooks should work and it dissolves our

preconceptions of how much there is to gain from a cognitive point of view: this type of novels requires deeper concentration and attention to detail from part of the reader, there being many details in the figurative and literal background. Much can be said with colour, shapes or a single line, which allows for personal reading and interpretation and will then open the room for rich debates. “Graphic novels allow students to more intimately connect with human experiences at the intersections of social identities, diversity and social justice issues, and policy and practice implications.” (Domyancich-Lee et al., 2021, p.1)

It is interesting to note in articles such as Gee’s (2003), the mention of digital media and how it proposes “digital literacy” as a new kind, and to later read an up-to-date study such as Domyancich-Lee et al.’s (2021) where they raise the point of discussion about the unique learning needs of today’s “digital natives” with their digital literacy and skills already developed, if not embedded in them. In their work they note the heavy reliance on image-based data these people have, and justify why graphic novels will be effective in the task of reaching and teaching these said students.

On the same topic, Brenna (2013) carried out a case study which attempted to demonstrate the nature of the link and effect between graphic novels and approaches towards reading comprehension. The main research question revolved around how children applied their reading comprehension strategies in a metacognitive way, added to the interest to evince the potential of graphic novels to support and develop these skills for students. Her drawn conclusions were able to evidence that the students showed capacity to develop and implement two opposite tactics to their text interpretation: “keys” that supported the comprehension of more form-specific elements and “master keys” that braced strategies which aimed at the over-all comprehension, which can of course be later applied to other text categories. Student preferences were regarded and laid out, and it was noted that predilection towards graphic novels increased as the study advanced.

Moreover, Wong, W.L. et al. (2016) state the facts about how students with deficient reading abilities struggle more highly in their general knowledge-



acquisition through texts. Their study analysed “the reading skills of 188 Chinese–English bilingual undergraduates” (p.1), to compare their results in their abilities to interpret these works. both after interacting with standard texts and graphic novels. Their findings showed that the following this activity, learners displayed superior performance after interacting with graphic works, and that this was irrespective of their fluctuating general reading abilities or stances towards cognitive processes before the study. Graphic novels can improve reading comprehension skills, possibly because of having abundant amounts of pictures together with scarcer written words, and an almost inevitable appealing narrative. Additionally, the ones who read these, later made explicit their larger interest to follow this line and find out more about the practice. By putting together all the findings, the authors demonstrated that the style of presentation and materials chosen play an essential part in how reading comprehension, for a second language situation can be enhanced. They state how educators should therefore invest in a systematic way of educating students for visual literacy training, as it can bring forth great motivation and increase the literacy levels.

There is a global phenomenon of suboptimal reading performance, noticeably in English, as it is by far the most widely studied second language, but it is parting from that concern where researchers have carried out investigations to acknowledge the situation, analyse the problem and try to find a viable solution. Studies by Klingner, Artiles, & Barletta (2006) firstly showed the difference between students of foreign language and native speakers, particularly in reading comprehension performance. In another study, carried out by Mazzeo et al., (2000) for the Department of Education of United States, found that more than half of their sampled students from 4<sup>th</sup> to 12<sup>th</sup> grade always scored below the expected level in English.

Around the globe, EFL learners are often documented as underachieving in their reading comprehension abilities, and as this is vital to pass exams and to enter college and be later successful, we should count with more research to understand and tackle the problems of reading acquisition processes. In Thailand, Akkakoson, (2013) tells of students who struggle because of lack of

motivation to engage with the language in an extramural way. Likewise, Ghavamnia et al. (2013) recount of Persian students who face complications at the time of decoding authentic work written in the English language at university, despite of their constant practice since early primary. Almost mirrored in Taiwan, graduate and undergraduate students struggle in reading academic texts and understanding the subject-specific material (Chou, 2013). We cannot relegate and dismiss knowledge acquisition; it should be something nurtured constantly and consistently from an early age and not constrained regarding what universities. Increasing efforts should be made to guarantee suitable reading-skills levels before secondary education finishes.

The devised tactics to encourage reading, will generally aim at teaching effective reading-comprehension strategies, promoting and increasing leisurely reading or enriching vocabulary acquisition (Ghavamnia et al., 2013; Belgar, Hunt, & Kite, 2012; Brown, Waring, & Donkaewbua, 2008 respectively). Then again, aside from thinking and creating new ways to teach this, a parallel method is to actually alter the text's format altogether. As it has happened with technology and digital interfaces and its inclusion in the classroom as a daily tool, it can happen with "physical multimedia". The case of graphic novels to be included in the lessons as an alternate format is driven by numerous factors.

There is an underlying and clearly misguided belief that students do not require to develop and add visual literacy to their abilities. This would mean not teaching them or developing the required abilities to correctly read visual stimuli, let alone how to decode them, or to compose and transmit eloquent dialogues using visual elements (Metros, 2008). It is common practice in all levels to present students with visual materials of some kind during their processes of knowledge acquisition, yet the breadth and shallow depth of this clashes with the high expectations students face in academic studies. This is due to the maladaptive philosophy and practice of solely following learners' progression in literacy (Aleixo & Norris, 2010), meaning that systems tend to reduce students' dependence on pictures and increase the curriculum's dependence around written texts. Schwarz (2010) proposes the possible solution to be the teaching of visual literacy by means of implementing graphic

novels, and he is not alone in this. The scope which graphic novels cover is quite vast and there are many scholars who have been examining their themes, from a literary perspective as well. These novels contain rich topics, erudite metaphors, social, cultural and historical criticism and revisionism, and therefore are a fantastic gateway into literacy development, a paved way to engage with reluctant readers (Jobe & Sakari, 1999; Syma & Weiner, 2010)

Graphic novels are essentially scenes of live and highly complex multimodality, as they are “comprised not only of linguistic elements, but also some combination of visual audio gestural, and spatial elements” (Jacobs, 2014, para.4). The readers will therefore simultaneously be engaging, making meaning of and deciphering a multitude of elements, from words, compositions, colours, lines and gestures, making the activity itself a richer process to tick many boxes as well as potentially piquing the interests of an immense audience. It is through Cook & Kirchoff’s (2017) work, for example, where we can see practical applications of the multiple roles graphic novels can take on in multimodal literacy education, including them as “mentor texts for a variety of multimodal compositions.” (p.90). These applications gather valuable data to clarify the understanding of the possibilities and creative multiplicity to be achieved from the implementation of graphic novels in learning spaces.

### ***Usefulness and value under the CLIL spectrum. CLIL tools, materials and what makes one***

Notwithstanding the characteristics of graphic novels, their clearly creative input and originality, what bears clarifying is their suitability for a CLIL environment. For this to be taken seriously we need to remind ourselves of what CLIL means in all its parts, what type of elements are applied and how these should be, what they should include and inherently propose. Teacher preparation, attitude and active participation in all parts of the process of teaching is understood to be already in place, for otherwise it simply could not be considered CLIL. Now, under this scope, some examples will be analysed as to prove or disprove their suitability for this method and see if they are to be considered proper materials

for the integrated teaching of content and language. A quick revision of what CLIL is, its key elements, expectations and processes in the classroom, elements to keep in mind and the cornerstones of the method should be listed and contrasted with qualities of graphic novels, their versatility and applicability in these contexts.

Marsh & Lange's (2000) definition elegantly captures the essence of the method defining it as an umbrella term which with its dual focus, attempts to implement a foreign language in the teaching and learning of new content. Rather than understanding language as a system of steps and regulations, CLIL theory attempts to pronounce it as a supply and fountain for meaning. The emphasis is on the process experienced when learning the target-language becomes a by-product only because of what and how the content is being delivered. Therefore, by using graphic novels we can make the topic and the language available and accessible in an unexpected way in which students absorb both parts unnoticeably and fluidly. In Dalton-Puffer et al.'s words, "CLIL does not happen instead of foreign language teaching but alongside it" (2014, p.215). It is like this that academic and cognitive skills can be tackled, developed and simultaneously learn a language and become proficient. By doing this, they learn "Basic Interpersonal Communication Skills (BICS) and Cognitive Academic Language Proficiency (CALP)" (Cummins, 1999). The simultaneity that we look for in CLIL is comfortably presented by graphic novels and in their multimodal characteristic as well. By including and joining what was until that moment opposite sides of the organisation of education, we can notice an increase in meaningful interaction with the aimed linguistical elements.

The goal is to achieve a "planned pedagogic integration of contextualized content, cognition, communication and culture into teaching and learning practice" (Coyle et al. 2010, p.6). Coyle (2007) referred to this structure as the 4 Cs: four points that would become the pillars of the CLIL method. Content, which can be understood as the concrete subject being taught; Communication is the active use of the target language; Cognition which refers to the cognitive steps undertaken by the learner, and finally Culture, which aims at covering different aspects of what it means to inhabit a globalised world. By a quick

analysis, we see that these four pillars are inadvertently tackled and covered by graphic novels. The content, taking for granted that the material is correctly chosen, will be presented and covered, and its innovative format and presentation of ideas will be on its own the starter of discussions and debates, hence covering communication and activating cognitive processes at the same time. This progression carries with it a deepening of intercultural knowledge, opening up to new perspectives, from the book itself and the work inside the classroom.

Learning through construction rather than instruction (Marsh, 2006) or scaffolding (Mehisto et al. 2008) are key premises in CLIL contexts. What they mean is that higher success rates are seen if learners engage in activities which motivate them. If there is pertinent and useful content being imparted, CLIL allows for appropriate, meaningful learning experiences. This step-by-step focus, aims at covering specific needs, which are adjusted to the students' level of proficiency. By taking into account their requirements in cognition and affective sides, there is a gradual build-up, starting from basics, where we can ensure interesting and engaging sessions, making it a pleasing experience in which the students can progress without being overburdened.

CLIL is built upon standards which can be construed as constructivist, and therefore we are also favouring learning by doing, something that requires learners to have an active role in their own process. This means that they will be placed in the centre of the scene and are expected to interact in frequent collaborative learning activities as well as being actively responsible for their development. Regarding this last point, by engaging visually, graphic novels will also challenge them cognitively, as there are now more elements to decode in the materials given. This interaction and their new position, will spark interactions amongst peers, as well as present a clear gateway to propose activities by the teacher. While there is more weight on the learners' shoulders, we are favouring a more autonomous type of learning. Something which positions the student in a leading, where active and interactive learning is encouraged and advocated.

CLIL's method can be seen as an attempt to update our learning spaces, an effort to target the foci of today's education with our practices inside them. It signifies an occasion to set aside the model of education of transmission of knowledge, and remaining vigilant and active in the post-modern times of educational revolution. Task-based or project based, collaborative, meaning-focus, are now considered essential in fostering this revolutionary pedagogy. On a pragmatic level, the dual-focus is preparing students in a process of internationalization and integration. Be it for their future studies or working lives, the results are of increased employability, better equipping for an increasingly complex and culturally diverse globalised world. For these students, however, this means an added dimension and requirement which can surely seem daunting. Being a multi-dimensional challenge, it can spark in them feelings of insecurity, anxiety or intimidation. This can be because of the study of complex academic subjects through a foreign language. Smith (2005) assimilates the difficulty of dividing the attention between two demanding factors, (language and content) to studying in "misty" instead of "clear" weather, a reality that can undoubtedly burden students with perceptions of inferiority, lack of confidence and overall demotivation which will hinder their performance.

For innovation, multiplicity and scaffolded learning in a dual-focused methodology, graphic novels seem to gracefully hand us a golden key as to help our classes take a turn for the better and include our students in a modernised, motivating and challenging process. Materials are frequently mentioned as yet another obstacle (Lancaster 2018; Morton, 2013), there being scarcely any production of resources while the existing ones are often seen as lacking in either applicability, feasibility or simply general quality. This leaves teachers with the poor options of choosing between them or the intimidating and energy-consuming task of preparing their own. In this modernisation of the educational space, we must accompany the effort by broadening our scope in considering other alternatives which may not be official content materials. Graphic novels are not just a colourful format: they allow us to access multiple authors from any country in the world representing their own values and cultural view on any topic we are aiming to teach. This allows us to not limit ourselves to

any nation or specific style, making the actual learning material varied and exciting. This goes hand in hand with CLIL's virtues regarding culture which have expressed in numerous occasions. Augmenting consciousness towards our place in a multi-cultural and highly complex ever-changing globalised experience, building intercultural knowledge and opens up for intercultural communication. In sum, it proposes rich occasions for exchange and knowledge which take an extramural dimension when compared to what traditional language learning settings offer.

CLIL is "commonly perceived as a flexible operational framework for language instruction, with a heterogeneity of prototypical models and application options available for different contexts and pedagogical needs" (Dueñas 2004, p.75). If we consider graphic novels as purely authentic for their independent and creative nature, we reveal that they allow for flexibility in scaffolding, application in all the different levels, as well as having access to many works and authors who may treat the same topics in their own particular way. There is a plethora of options and styles, and we have the opportunity to use complex works in higher level groups, even if the text itself is somehow word-limited. We cannot keep falling into the same loophole of requiring pre-digested texts, and *only* texts. Graphic novels are innately adapted for our classrooms even if we do not recognise them as such. The fact is that if the scaffold is too low then progress is only an ideal. CLIL demands flexible and creative ways of working, while indeed presenting a challenge, however controlled it may be, and these novels allow us to provide what is needed.

Classrooms can be seen as microcosms of society in terms culture, gender identities, preferences (religious, aesthetic), multiplicity of ethnicities and perspectives, etc. While the rosters are getting more diverse, the texts and materials used are regrettably still following a traditional line and pattern, of western eurocentrism and racial and patriarchal bias evident. Our aim as CLIL teachers is to engage with and propel our students in all aspects. For this, we need the method's advantages to be reflected in the volitional side and embrace the elements that will include minorities, new visions, modern ways of thinking, etc, as to engage lively and genuinely with our learners. Motivation, if we

consider it as the guiding motor, is to be enhanced and continually sustained if we want to notice L1 and FL interest exponentially increased. Linking this attitudinal reinforcement with the learning content and language, it will unavoidably raise their confidence levels and our expectations to the posed challenges. Motivation is crucial in any learning situation and in CLIL it should be the cornerstone that guides and supports the educational processes. The teacher's role and attitude have to be combined with the engaging and exciting materials for the whole process to come to fruition.



## **Objectives and Hypothesis**

### **General Objective**

To carry out a theoretical overview and revision of existing literature as to verify the effects graphic novels have on the motivational side of students and their literacy as well as define if these could be considered as effective tools to be implemented in the CLIL classroom.

### **Specific Objectives**

- Analyse the existing literature from the last ten years regarding the use of graphic novels in learning environments.
- Verify existence or absence of effect that these have in programmes including graphic novels as a teaching and learning tool.
- Analyse the possibility of graphic novels being a defining element in student motivation towards literacy development.
- Analyse the use of graphic novels in schools as a multimodal tool to foment pluriliteracies.
- Evaluate the possible effectivity of graphic novels as a CLIL tool.
- Present and compare the obtained results and data, opposite the ones introduced in the theoretical framework.

### **Hypothesis**

The main hypothesis is that graphic novels present themselves as a timely, complete and complex tool which can be applied in all classrooms and with all ages. This makes them carry an enormous potential of motivating, engaging and ameliorating students' levels in all literacy levels.

## **Methodology**

For this study a theoretical overview of the topic of use and implementation of graphic novels in the learning environments was carried out utilising different sources as to evince its width of execution and effects.

The literature review was realised between 1 May and 6 June, and the references, literature and sources taken from ResearchGate, Dialnet and ProQuest, through their respective search engine libraries.

### **Inclusion and Exclusion criteria**

After a first trial of direct search under the parameters of “graphic novels”, the scope had to be narrowed and made closer to the interests at hand. Therefore, combinations between graphic novels and education, motivation, CLIL, literacy, and pluriliteracies were added to the searches.

Taking into consideration that the number of articles covering the pertaining topics which contained the criteria would be low, the decision was made to include works from the last ten years, including all the published texts from January 2012 to May 2022. From the results obtained, only studies in English were chosen, and those which could be accessed fully and freely through the servers abovementioned. Qualitative and quantitative research was taken into consideration, as hard data would help to build a stronger case towards this work’s aims.

The criteria applied to the works chosen depended on several factors, discriminated solely for this work’s author’s interests, and its present and future applicability. The list is presented below.

-Population: Human participants aged between 12 and 30 who are in a condition of student in any centre or ongoing course

-Intervention: Studies carried out in an educational reality, from secondary, tertiary or university level. Studies which aim at engaging, motivating and promoting literacies, reading skills, motivation and generate conscience towards the importance and influence of reading.

There were no restrictions towards the actual type of study (systematic revision, thesis, doctoral works, etc), the size of the samples in each or the country where it was carried out in.

-Study design: Studies carried out since 2012 until the present day, written in the English language. Quantitative, qualitative or mixed studies.

While the results varied noticeably between servers, it is interesting to see as well that in all of them the number of publications, with same search queries and filters applied, decreased immensely from 2012 until today. In any case, it is from these vast quantities from which a selection of works was chosen were the main themes and topics covered the interests and objective of this research.

<b>Search Criteria</b>	<b>Server</b>	<b>Science Direct</b>	<b>ProQuest</b>	<b>Dialnet</b>
<b>Graphic novels</b>		106	581	128
<b>Graphic novels AND motivation</b>		80	504	0
<b>Graphic novels AND literacy</b>		74	446	5
<b>Graphic novels AND multimodal</b>		39	217	4
<b>Graphic novels AND CLIL</b>		4	67	0

Table 1 – Preliminary results after first search with filters applied

### ***Process of Study Selection***

The table above shows the first groups of results for this research. Nevertheless, it was through a combination of steps that the final selection was made. These are the following:

A) **Initial Search:** Firstly, through the search engines from each server, the specified combinations of criteria were input, only English language and from the last ten years. The results varied in a somewhat surprising way, and while Dialnet brought few results in all search criteria, ProQuest and Science Direct delivered more generously. In the latter for example, filters could be applied as to limit the area of expertise or specific foci. This was repeated for each new search as to have consistency in the final results. All in all, the broad numbers, with the filters of “education”, language and linguistics” were applied as to exclude from the go the categories which did not interest the author. The results received for each server and search criteria are reflected in Table 1 followed bellow.

B) **Selection by Title:** as the terms input in the search engines brought several findings which were not related with the aim of this research, it was necessary to carry out a manual filter and select through the reading of each title to scan for the unwanted options. A fair number of these had to still go through the next step as the titles did not present enough information for us to know if it indeed covered our desired topics.

C) **Selection by abstract:** following the previous filters, a finer combing was carried out as to evince the proper criteria inclusion, and to also check on the focus presented by the authors. Here, repeated and irrelevant publications were discarded as well.

D) **Selection by full-length reading:** Once the previous steps were finished and the criteria was guaranteed to meet the objectives and interest of the investigation, accessing and/or downloading the works through the servers came forth. Finally, a thorough reading and revision of this final selection was carried out, selecting and keeping only the pertinent ones, to the ends of this research.

Following this series of steps, the final selection counted with 28 works that overarch different applications in learning environments, in different countries, with opposite treatment of the learning materials but where they nonetheless

show the flexibility of the format of graphic novels and its immense practicality for our classrooms.

## **Results**

Through the first step of the bibliographic search the number of works that matched the criteria was quite big. A total of 2255 came up on the preliminary search not before discarding some which made these digits even bigger. The reason of this high number was due to the fact that the term “graphic” appears in a number of articles referring to other uses of the word (graphic arts, graphics/charts, digital graphics etc) and “novel” appears in medicine or engineering related articles as well, regarding novel methods or perceptions, as is it in neuropsychology or medical philosophy, for example. That is why from the enormous starting quantity a considerable amount was left aside, leading to a more manageable figure.

After the selection phases and abstract readings, a total of 52 articles were taken to be read in full, of which 28 resulted eligible to give enough and pertinent information to be analysed under the objectives of this work. These are:

Anderson, Robinson & Brynteson (2015), Bailey Jones (2015), Baçal, Aytan & Demir (2016), Baylen, D’Alba (2015), Becker (2020), Burger (2018), Carano & Clabough (2016), Chattopadhyay (2017), Connors (2013), Cook (2016), Eaton (2012), Martin (2012), Hargadon (2018), Barter-Storm & Wik (2020), Issa (2017), Jaffe & Hurwich (2018), Kavaloski (2018), Lundy & Stephens (2015), Maruo-Schröder (2018), Meyer, Mahalingappa, & Brugar (2019), Ogier & Ghosh (2017), Pettitt (2017), Piatti-Farnell (2017), Sabbah, Masood & Iranmanesh (2013), Sabeti (2013), Sabeti (2012), Thomas (2012), and Wong Wai Lap et al. (2016).

This selection is all works or research which cover the application of graphic narratives (graphic novels and comics) in different educational situations or the analysis of the works and the themes they cover, to be later introduced in a lesson. The works which cover topics such as CLIL, multimodality,

pluriliteracies, which are a point of interest for this thesis, have been mentioned and added in the bibliographical references, but the main body is meant to be the implementation and diversity that graphic materials add on their own to the classroom.

### **Characteristics of the selected studies**

The works selected do not cover a wide array of countries and they show an ample majority of studies coming from the USA (19), followed by the UK (4) and then only one case for the countries of Turkey, Malaysia, New Zealand, Hong Kong and Germany. A quick review of the list, mentioning country, topic or focus covered and ideal level of implementation is seen below in Table 2.

<b>Author</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Topic/Focus</b>	<b>Country</b>
Sabbah, Masood & Iranmanesh (2013)	Primary	Reading comprehension	Malaysia
Hargadon (2018)	Primary	Learner Motivation	USA
Cook (2016)	Secondary	Reading Comprehension	USA
Carano & Clabough (2016)	Secondary	Human rights, social studies	USA
Chattopadhyay (2017)	Secondary	Social conscience	USA/India
Baylen & D'Alba (2015)	Secondary	Visual Literacy	USA
Connors (2013)	Secondary after-	Multimodal	USA

		school reading group	
Thomas (2012)	Secondary	Visual arts	USA
Barter-Storm B, Wik T. (2020)	Secondary	Social justice, motivation,	USA
Jaffe, & Hurwich (2018)	Secondary	Visual verbal literacy	USA
Burger (2018)	Secondary	Multimodal literacy	USA
Meyer, Mahalingappa, & Brugar (2019)	Secondary	Social studies and English	USA
Becker (2020)	Secondary	Language and literacy	USA
Sabeti (2013)	Secondary / after school club	Literacy	UK
Pettitt (2017)	Secondary/Upper levels	Genocide/Holocaust	UK
Lundy & Stephens (2015)	University	Visual literacy	USA
Sabeti (2012)	University	Context and critical reading	UK
Bailey Jones (2015)	University - upper-level undergraduate/graduate level	Racism, Muslims	USA

Anderson, Robinson & Brynteson (2015)	University	Higher education audiences and of interest to K–12 educators	USA
Eaton (2012)	University	Culture, history	USA
Kavaloski (2018)	University	History journalism	USA
Martin (2012)	University	Terrorism	USA
Piatti-Farnell (2017)	University	Sexual violence, disrupted histories, gendered politics	New Zealand
Issa, S. (2017)	College students, teachers of English	Multimodal literacy, composition, creative writing	USA
Wong Wai Lap et al. (2016)	University	Reading abilities	Hong Kong
Maruo-Schröder (2018)	University - upper-level learners of English	Formative – War and conflict	Germany
Başal, Aytan & Demir (2016)	University	Vocabulary Teaching in ELT	Turkey
Ogier & Ghosh (2017)	Course for primary teacher students	Formative	UK

Table 2 – Overview of topics covered by each author and countries.



In Table 2 we can appreciate the main characteristics of each study and in all of them, the pivoting point is the implementation of graphic novels, in different modalities and for different ends. While there is little to no information regarding the participants who were in each application, their socio-economic status, age of general background, the objective of their research is well defined and documented, despite the lack of hard data in most of them.

The origin in these publications is variegated and indeed varied. The vast majority from USA followed by the UK, shows the importance given in these countries, but also speaks of the inclination these have towards the medium. This added weight can also be ascribed to the fact that English is the adopted international language and the number of works available increases exponentially. In addition, not only translations play a big part in this, but international authors may tend to write in English as it broadens their target audience significantly. In the rest of the countries mentioned, while only with one article, they all aim at demonstrating the validity and timeliness of the application of graphic novels, its power to push boundaries and refresh the classroom. These publications are not related amongst each other and have quite dissimilar objectives in mind.

These research works cover a wide array of topics and purposes. These range from language learning and vocabulary acquisition in an EFL classroom to the dismantling of social and racial beliefs and stereotypes. While the demographics are not always specified, we can still see certain qualities and inclinations depending on the country it was applied in or planned for. Nevertheless, it is the USA the one who will cover many more paths and ideas, for quantitative reasons.

Disregarding the country of origin, we can recognise an attempt to deal with different struggles and present time difficulties. This we see it in that all educational levels and centres are covered. From the more direct angle of motivating students to read in the primary classroom, to the tackling of problems such as rape culture or racism in a university classroom, we are able to notice the element of graphic novels as a multitool which can serve many purposes. It

is a notable point as well, that while some works like Art Spiegelman's (1980) "Maus" which is mentioned several times across words pertaining graphic novels, it is applied in different manners for different purposes altogether.

This latter fact, can open up the realities inside schools and classrooms in general. A book that can be used for different subjects, to teach varied literacies and cover social, political and ideological problems, presents itself as an almost magical answer to today's teachers' questions and doubts. This is not an easy to ignore fact and will show as well the flexibility these works have. The effects of which can be seen in the variety of cases and countries applied, which are certainly more than the 28 selected for this thesis, but also in the results obtained and reactions noted in many of the practical applications.

In general terms, students and teachers who started their path into graphic novels, took their first step imbued in doubt and mistrust. As the courses went on, students of all ages started to engage with the works and format itself, gaining in confidence and clarity as much as interest and self-inquiry. Hargadon (2018) mentions authors who make graphic novels highly entertaining and make it very appealing for students and sees the effect in her classroom. Barter-Storm and Wik (2020) created a unit layout to dive deep into the analysis of the series of graphic novels "March" by John Lewis (2013). These books provide a first-hand version civil rights movement in the U.S.A. Interestingly for this work, this proposal and its resources than accompany it, were made to enable the possibility of adaptation to ELL/EFL classrooms around the world, covering diverse issues oriented towards racial and equity problems. Their research investigates the power and potential for the purposes of engaging with learners in processes of deep and critical thinking, about complex issues, "through readings, discussions, journaling, and completing research projects on social justice themes worldwide." (p.1). Value can be recognised here in how this once neglected format can today open up the room for intelligent and engaging debates but also allow for different ways of working around the language. In the case of "March", the sole topic announces a personal perspective and stance. This, like works such as "Palestine" by Joe Sacco (1993), can promote the writing and discourse in general in a more journalistic

manner, which can help develop language and vocabulary as well as infuse the students in the topic at hand.

Understanding the subject matter is not just a question of motivation and attitude towards it. Authors like Başal, Aytan & Demir (2016) and Sabbah, Masood & Iranmanesh (2013) understand this need and concern, visible clearly in primary and up until graduate and post-graduate levels. To be able to understand the content, students need more than their curiosity, and if texts are in some manner the fundamental point of the lessons, reading comprehension should be tackled sooner rather than later. Nevertheless, like Wong Wai Lap et al. (2016) have noticed, these problems are still present in the highest levels of education and the further up they go, the more complex the circumstances are and all the more difficult it would be to right the wrongs. Understanding that as students rise in the educational ladder, the expectations and intricacy of topics increases and deepens, the scaffolding approach becomes more important still, and this is something easily carried out with graphic novels. While the themes covered in graphic narratives can be as complex as any, the amount of text allows us to work around it and present it to students in an undaunting way. This added flexibility allows for the class itself to relax and tackle different linguistic situations from a comfortable position, building up on difficulty as the time and the course advance. It is by the added and interconnected use of pictures and symbols that the learning process can be accelerated and reinforced. The supplementary visual elements work as stimuli and as incentives for our learners, making texts and intricate themes appealing and easily digestible.

## **Discussion and Conclusions**

### **Effectivity of graphic novels as a multimodal tool for pluriliteracies**

As stated in this work's objectives, the application of graphic novels as a teaching tool, with multimodal focus on literacies development, was analysed. The studies selected show these applications were carried out in the last ten years, in all levels of education. All of this brings up the question of its concrete efficacy in the different phases and issues faced.

On the one hand, regarding primary education and its applications, there is very little research done on the level and on the specific role of graphic novels. Authors agree that this is a crucial phase for literacy development, but still, we have insufficient evidence for this educational stage. On the other hand, we have a broad range of authors and applications, like Cook (2016), Connors (2013), Becker (2020), Sabeti (2013), Jaffe, & Hurwich (2018) and Burger (2028) who directed their research towards secondary students, meaning children aged from 11 to 18, evaluating the concrete application and use of graphic novels to test and develop reading comprehension, literacy, language, and multimodal literacy. All of which are points which simultaneously concern students and preoccupy teachers. Other authors, such as Carano & Clabough (2016), Barter-Storm B, Wik T. (2020) or Pettitt (2017) to name a few, direct their research on theme and subject development through graphic novels, and their aims and concerns are quite different to the others'. Despite the analysed problems being unequal, the results were of similar grade, noticing improvements in drive and engagement, making us realise how this tool can be of insurmountable help for teachers and instructors.

In light of this evidence, the balance seems to turn towards a clear affirmation of the efficacy and positive cost-benefit relationship of graphic novels as a learning tool. The results show levels of effectiveness of graphic novels in the improvement of motivational problems, reading comprehension deficiencies and vocabulary acquisition. Notwithstanding, there is surely a long path to tread regarding these matters and tools; quantifying data along with generating more structured approaches and investigations is needed for us to be able to

ascertain the perspective towards the factual reality, risks, benefit and challenges involved in this process, short and long term.

Regarding the research question concerning the multimodality of graphic novels as a pluriliteracy key to the classrooms, it can be said that it is not fully answered. While the multimodal aspect is clear and made so by several authors, they assure us of the picturesquely attractive effect it has on students, and motivation-wise is a complete success. Still, it is the teaching and learning effect we look for, and the probability of all these elements really transmitting what we wish to teach. As it is always the case, much relies on the teacher's role, to convey the objective, meaning and way of reading, especially visually-rich books like these. The long-term effect of these applications is still unregistered, and would add much to the debate and definitely tip the scale. Hence, while the research seems to guarantee the triumph of this tool, this remains to be confirmed, and its success rate analysed through all standpoints.

### ***School as a first contact point and graphic novels as constant motivators***

Another question fixed the interest on shedding light on the possibility of graphic novels being a crucial element for motivation in educational centres to promote literacy. Authors like Sabbah, Masood & Iranmanesh (2013) and Hargadon (2018) covered the struggles in reading comprehension and learner motivation respectively, both in primary education in the USA. If we consider school as the initial and formative space-time for students, for a process of life-long learning as well as a live course of interactions and exchanges, we need to focus our attention on these preliminary stages and reach the root of the questions. It is interesting to see how many applications were made in university and higher education levels, but much less attention was drawn to the previous and seminal stages for the same students. When we ignore the importance of the developmental phase the problems for our learners become increasingly thorny, for students and teachers alike.

Motivation development and reinforcement is crucial to get a confident grip on more cognitively demanding tasks. Students need what could be called the

inspiration part of learning, but actually what they require is more of a systematically designed input for them to engage in a holistic manner, which will in turn help cement their own motivations. As their skills develop together with language sureness, their self-esteem will enjoy a forward thrust and help them abandon self-doubt and what we considered reluctant readers.

Children's author Isabel Thomas makes efforts to clarify differences between reluctant readers and struggling readers, and the implications of each case. For our purposes, it is thought-provoking to note what affects our disinclined students at the moment of reading. She mentions how research consistently demonstrates that children who read for pleasure do better at school, and this connotation goes hand-in-hand with our interest in motivating them. How can we transform learning materials into encouraging tools and generate self-motivated students, interested and critical readers?

Throughout her time and experience as an author, she noticed an interesting shift in reluctant readers' attitude towards different mediums. When modern technology and students' rejection to seemingly overwhelming books was mentioned before, the adaptation of works from physical to digital was not considered. This was observed by Thomas and she adds to the importance of adapting our methods to modern needs and preferences, at the very least to get young people to acclimate to the action of reading, in a format they control and enjoy, before presenting them with what they consider to be daunting literature. The author reflects on several points to keep in mind to enthuse future readers.

Firstly, we should allow and promote the reading for pleasure. If we can focus on making reading more fun and exciting for them, we can avoid making it feel like a chore or an exigent race. Next, we could add humour to the activity, as this will make them engage in a relaxed manner but also permits the play on words, joke making and vocabulary mixing which stimulates different cognitive areas (linguistic growth, data processing, intellect, reasoning, and memory). Thirdly, to consider the digital platforms, e-books and online portals which entice young digitally-native readers. To this, she equals to swapping classic books for graphic novels: change the format to one in which the reader will be

naturally hooked. Subsequently, she brings up the importance of reading for purpose. Attention-grabbing content is key, nevertheless, we need to utilise books that link to the learner's existing passions and interests and that allow these to be fomented, stimulated, and included in the very process of reading. This can mean activities throughout the book, involving crafts, creative writing, responses and reactions to the book, etc. Finally, linked to this last point, is the possibility to share and connect what they are reading with their peers. Working with series of books or film-related ones, can encourage them to continue and work their way around the texts. Making it an evocative experience for young readers allows for the book itself to transcend the "academic" barrier and transform the practise into something more memorable and long-lasting.

### **Possible Limitations**

Once the research was done and ideas noted, in an attempt to prove graphic novels' potential to teach and learn, and ideally to propose it as a CLIL tool, we can surely notice some limitations in the study which in turn hinder the completion of the objectives.

The first one is that there were no studies which showed long-term results, so we cannot be certain the real efficacy or long-lasting effect graphic novels have on students. We can have a close guess if we follow a critical analysis and project the findings, but it would back our case to have hard data and follow up instances to see how these effects may mark the continuous learning.

A second one is that there we no results found and therefore analysed reading specific applications in a CLIL environment. This makes the achievement of the objective mere speculation but does raise the question if we are missing something by not using graphic novels with the method.

Lastly is the lack of variety and supremacy of the studies originating from the USA. This tells us of the foci in education in the listed countries and that maybe because of the novelty of it all, teachers are not ready to apply this tool in their lessons.

## **Conclusions**

With the general and specific objectives stated for this thesis I can say the results obtained were at times surprising and thought-provoking. There are plenty of researchers investigating the topic and I think it is a timely and accessible tool that has the potential to change how students face literacy and reading as a whole.

Regarding effectiveness as CLIL tool, it can be said that graphic novels are potentially a great asset, and evidently a great tool to spark interest, discussion and critical thinking with a multicultural focus. The content presented helps to work on cognition from many aspects and that has to have a lot of value for today's classrooms.

I think some objectives were achieved to a higher extent than others, for which more research and time would be necessary, as well as possibly broadening the search spectrum and readings. Nevertheless, it is from this point where we have open questions for future research. Do the effects last? Is the input strong enough or should it be reinforced constantly? Can more graphic novels be created as specific teaching tools. Some have, so is there a "market" for this? Can they be specifically created for teachers?

All in all, I can conclude that the findings are engaging and will pique the interest of researchers, teachers and students alike. Quality input from the hand of artists may as well be what we are needing in our lessons. As teachers we cannot ignore the fact that a multi-tool such as this one can solve at least part of our daily efforts and simplify tasks in an entertaining way.



## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Akkakoson, S. (2013). *Journal of Research in Reading*, 36(4), 422–450.  
<https://doi.org/10.1111/jrir.12004>.
- Aleixo, P., & Norris, C. (2010). The Comic Book Textbook. *Education And Health*, 28, 72–74.
- Anderson, E., Robinson, R., Brynteson, K. (2015). Teaching Visual Literacy: Pedagogy, Design and Implementation, Tools, and Techniques. In: Baylen, D., D'Alba, A. (eds) *Essentials of Teaching and Integrating Visual and Media Literacy*, 265–290. Springer, Cham.  
[https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-05837-5\\_14](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-05837-5_14)
- Ayaka, C., & Hague, I. (2014). Representing Multiculturalism in Comics and Graphic Novels (1st ed.). Routledge.  
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315775340>
- Barter-Storm, B. & Wik, T. (2020). Using Social Justice Graphic Novels in The ELL Classroom. *TESOL Journal*. 11(4),  
<https://doi.org/10.1002/tesj.551>.
- Başal, A., Aytan, T., & Demir, İ. (2016). Teaching Vocabulary with Graphic Novels. *English Language Teaching*, 9(9), 95-109.
- Baylen, D.M. & D'Alba, A. (2015). *Essentials of Teaching and Integrating Visual and Media Literacy*. Cham: Springer International Publishing.  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-05837-5>.
- Becker, P.A. (2020). Teaching Language and Literacy Through the Visual Arts: An Interdisciplinary, Literature-Based Approach. *Teaching Exceptional Children*, 52(3), 166–179. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0040059919894736>.
- Belgar, D., Hunt, A., & Kite, Y. (2012). The Effect of Pleasure Reading on Japanese University EFL Learners' Reading Rates. *Language Learning*, 62, 665–703. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9922.2011.00651.x>

- Biçaku, R.Ç. (2011). CLIL and Teacher Training. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 15, 3821–3825.  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.04.379>.
- Block, K. (2013). Teacher Perceptions of Graphic Novels. *Graduate Research Papers*, 31. Available at <http://scholarworks.uni.edu/grp/31>
- Bloom, B. S.; Engelhart, M. D.; Furst, E. J.; Hill, W. H. & Krathwohl, D. R. (1956). *Taxonomy Of Educational Objectives: The Classification of Educational Goals. Handbook I: Cognitive domain*. New York: David McKay Company.
- Bonnett, A., (2012). Towards An Evidence Base For CLIL: How to Integrate Qualitative and Quantitative as Well As Process, Product and Participant Perspectives In CLIL Research. *International CLIL Research Journal* 1(4), 66-78.
- Braquier, C., (2013). En Quoi L'Enseignement En Langue Étrangère D'une Discipline Non Linguistique Influence-t-Elle Les Représentations Qu'ont Les Élèves De Cette LVE ? Institut Universitaire de Formation des Maîtres Ecole interne de l'Université d'Artois
- Brenna, B. (2013). How Graphic Novels Support Reading Comprehension Strategy Development in Children. *Literacy*, 47, 88–94.  
<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1741-4369.2011.00655.x>
- Brown, R., Waring, R., & Donkaewbua, S. (2008). Incidental Vocabulary Acquisition from Reading, Reading-While Listening, And Listening to Stories. *Reading in a Foreign Language*, 20, 136–163.
- Burger, A. (2018). *Teaching Graphic Novels in the English Classroom: Pedagogical Possibilities of Multimodal Literacy Engagement*. Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave McMillan.
- Callahan, R. B. (2009). *Perceptions And Use of Graphic Novels in The Classroom*. Master Thesis, Ohio University, Athens.

- Carano, K.T. & Clabough, J. (2016). Images of Struggle: Teaching Human Rights with Graphic Novels. *The Social Studies*, 107(1), 14–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00377996.2015.1094723>.
- Chattopadhyay, Dhiman (2017). Can Comic Books Influence Consumer Awareness and Attitude Towards Rape Victims and Perpetrators in India? The case of Priya's Shakti, *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*, 10(1), 28-46, <https://doi.org/10.1080/21504857.2017.1412992>
- Chou, M. (2013). Strategy Use for Reading English for General and Specific Academic Purposes in Testing And Non-Testing Contexts. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 48(2), 175–197. <https://doi.org/10.1002/rrq.42>
- Cohen, V. L., & Cowen, J. E. (2008). Literacy For Children in An Information Age: Teaching Reading, Writing, And Thinking. Belmont: Thomson Wadsworth.
- Connors, S.P. (2013). Weaving Multimodal Meaning in A Graphic Novel Reading Group. *Visual Communication*, 12(1), 27–53. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470357212462812>.
- Cook, M. & Kirchoff, J. (2017). Teaching Multimodal Literacy Through Reading and Writing Graphic Novels. *Language and Literacy*, 19. 76. <https://doi.org/10.20360/G2P38R>.
- Cook, M. P. (2017). Now I “See”: The Impact of Graphic Novels on Reading Comprehension in High School English Classrooms. *Literacy Research and Instruction*, 56(1), 21-53.
- Coyle, D. (1999). Theory and Planning for Effective Classrooms: Supporting Students in Content and Language Integrated Learning Contexts in Masih, *Learning Through a Foreign Language*, 46-62
- Coyle, D. (2007). Content and Language Integrated Learning: Towards a Connected Research Agenda for CLIL Pedagogies. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 10(5), 543–562. <https://doi.org/10.2167/beb459.0>.

- Coyle, D. (2011). The ITALIC Research Report: Investigating Student gains in Content and Language Integrated Learning. University of Aberdeen, School of Education. <http://www.abdn.ac.uk/italic>
- Coyle, D., (2010). Evaluating The Impact of CLIL Programmes, In: Content and Language Integrated Learning. Cambridge English.
- Crawford, P. (2004). A Novel Approach: Using Graphic Novels to Attract Reluctant Readers and Promote Literacy. *Library Media Connection*, 22(5), 26-28.
- Dalton-Puffer, C., (2007). Outcomes and processes in Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL): current research from Europe. *Anglistische Forschungen*. 388, 139-157.
- Dalton-Puffer, C., Llinares, A., Lorenzo, F., & Nikula, T. (2014). You Can Stand Under My Umbrella: Immersion, CLIL And Bilingual Education. A response to Cenoz, Genesee & Gorter. *Applied Linguistics*, 35, 213–218. <https://doi.org/10.1093/applin/amu010>
- Darsalina, L., Syamaun, A., & Sari, D. F. (2016). The Application of Comic Strips in Teaching Vocabulary. *Research in English and Education*, 1(2), 137-145.
- Dobrin, S.I. (2020). *EcoComix: essays on the environment in comics and graphic novels*. Jefferson North Carolina: Mcfarland & Company, Inc., Publishers.
- Dobson, A., Pérez Murillo, M.D., & Johnstone, R. (2010). Bilingual Education Project Spain Evaluation Report: Findings of the independent evaluation of the Bilingual Education Project Ministry of Education (Spain) and British Council (Spain). Ministerio De Educación Instituto de Formación del Profesorado, Investigación e Innovación Educativa (IFIIE), and British Council, Spain.
- Domyancich-Lee, S.C., Cleeland, L.R., & S. McCleary, J. (2021). Teaching Note - Comics in the Classroom: Teaching with Graphic Novels, *Journal*

of Social Work Education,  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/10437797.2021.1942353>

- Dueñas, María. (2004). The "whats", "whys", "hows" and "whos" of Content-Based Instruction in Second/Foreign Language Education. *International Journal of English Studies (IJES)*. 4(1), 73-96
- Eaton, L. (2012). The Power of Comics: History, Form and Culture, by Randy Duncan and Matthew J. Smith. *Journal of Graphic Novels & Comics*, 3(1), 117–118. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21504857.2011.629669>.
- Edward, B. (2009). Motivating Middle School Readers: The Graphic Novel Link. *School Library Media Activities Monthly*, 12(8), 56-58.
- Falter, M. (2017). "The Power and Potential of Graphic Novels in the Classroom." *Anthropology Now*, 9 (3): 144–146. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19428200.2017.1390725>
- Garrison, K., Wulff, E., & Lymn, J. (2021). Using Graphic Novels, Zines and Libraries to Reimagine Literacy in A Diverse Classroom. *Literacy Learning: The MiddleYears*, 29(3), 43–54. <https://doi.org/10.3316/>
- Gee, J.P. (2003). *What Video Games Have to Teach Us About Learning and Literacy*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Ghavamnia, M., Ketabi, S., & Tavakoli, M. (2013). L2 Reading Strategies Used by Iranian EFL Learners: A Think-Aloud Study. *Reading Psychology*, 34, 355–378.
- Hargadon, E.E. (2018). Using Graphic Novels to Motivate Readers. *The Reading Teacher*, 72(4), 529–530. <https://doi.org/10.1002/trtr.1732>.
- Hansen, K. S. (2012). In Defense of Graphic Novels. *English Journal*, 102(2), 57-63. [informit.069979772482117](https://doi.org/10.1080/00131801.2012.699797)
- Issa, S. (2017). Comics in the English Classroom: A Guide to Teaching Comics Across English Studies. *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*, 9(4), 310–328. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21504857.2017.1355822>.

- Jacobs, D. (2014). Webcomics, Multimodality, And Information Literacy, 7(3).
- Jaffe, M. & Hurwich, T. (2019). *Worth A Thousand Words: Using Graphic Novels to Teach Visual and Verbal Literacy*. San Francisco, Ca: Jossey-Bass, A Wiley Brand.
- James, E. S. (2016). *Graphic Novels as Tools for A Modern English Classroom*. Master thesis. State University of New York, Brockport.
- Jobe, R. & Dayton-Sakari, M. (1999). *Reluctant Readers: Connecting Students and Books for Successful Reading Experiences*. Ontario, Canada: Pembroke Publishers.
- Jones, R.B. (2015). (Re)thinking Orientalism: Using Graphic Narratives to Teach Critical Visual Literacy. Peter Lang. Available at: [https://books.google.ad/books/about/Re\\_thinking\\_Orientalism.html?id=auLQoQEACAAJ&redir\\_esc=y](https://books.google.ad/books/about/Re_thinking_Orientalism.html?id=auLQoQEACAAJ&redir_esc=y) [Accessed 15 Jun. 2022].
- Kavaloski, J. (2018). Discordant Discourses: History and Journalism in The Graphic Novels Of Joe Sacco. *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*, 1-18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21504857.2018.1431801>.
- Klingner, J.K., Artiles, A.J. & Barletta, L.M. (2006). English Language Learners Who Struggle with Reading. *Journal of Learning Disabilities*, 39(2), 108–128. doi:10.1177/00222194060390020101.
- Kress, G., & Van Leeuwen, T. (2001). *Multimodal Discourse: The Modes and Media of Contemporary Communication*. London: Arnold Publishers.
- Lancaster, Nina Karen (2018). Innovations and Challenges in CLIL Program Evaluation, *Theory into Practice*, 57(3), 250-257, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00405841.2018.1484034>
- Lankshear, C., & Knobel, M. (2003). *New Literacies: Changing Knowledge and Classroom Learning*. Open University Press, Buckingham, UK.
- Lewis, J., Aydin, A., & Powell, N. (2013). *March: Book One*. Marietta, GA: Top Shelf Productions.

- Llull, J. (2014). Comics and CLIL: Producing quality output in social sciences with Hergé's Adventures of Tintin. *Latin American Journal of Content and Language Integrated Learning*, 7(1), 40–65.  
<https://doi.org/10.5294/laclil.2014.7.1.3>
- Lundy, A.D. & Stephens, A.E. (2015). Beyond the Literal: Teaching Visual Literacy in the 21st Century Classroom. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 174, 1057–1060.  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.794>.
- Marsh, D. (2006). English As Medium of Instruction In The New Global Linguistic Order: Global Characteristics, Local Consequences. [online] CiteSeer. Available at:  
<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/summary?doi=10.1.1.125.2388>
- Martin, E. (2012). 'I' For Iconoclasm: Graphic Novels and the (Re)Presentation of Terrorism. *Critical Studies on Terrorism*, 5(3), pp.469–481.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/17539153.2012.723521>.
- Maruo-Schröder, N. (2018). Framing War. *Anglistik*, 29(1), pp.87–101. Available at: <https://angl.winter-verlag.de/article/angl/2018/1/8> [Accessed 15 Jun. 2022].
- Mehisto, P., Marsh, D., Frigols, M.J. (2008). Uncovering CLIL: Content and Language Integrated Learning in Bilingual and Multilingual Education. Oxford: Macmillan Publishers Ltd
- Mehisto, P. (2012). Criteria For Producing CLIL Learning Material. *Revista de investigación e innovación en la clase de idiomas*, 21, 15-33
- Merisuo-Storm, T. (2011). Students' First Language Skills in Bilingual Education. *Journal of Communications Research* 3, 85–101
- Metros, S.E. (2008). The Educator's Role in Preparing Visually Literate Learners, Theory into Practice, 47(2), 102-109,  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00405840801992264>
- Meyer, C.K., Mahalingappa, L.J., & Brugar, K.A. (2019). Thinking Inside the Box: Using Graphic Novels to English Language Learners in the Social

- Studies Classroom. In: de Oliveira, L., Obenchain, K., Kenney, R., Oliveira, A. (eds) Teaching the Content Areas to English Language Learners in Secondary Schools. *English Language Education*, 17. Springer, Cham. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-02245-7\\_20](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-02245-7_20)
- Meyer, O., (2010). Towards Quality-CLIL: Successful Planning and Teaching Strategies. *Pulse*, 33. 11-29
- Morton, T. (2013). Critically Evaluating Materials for CLIL: Practitioners' Practices and Perspectives. In: Gray, J. (eds) Critical Perspectives on Language Teaching Materials. Palgrave Macmillan, London. 111–136 [https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137384263\\_6](https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137384263_6)
- Mulholland, T. (2007). Britain Embraces the Graphic Novel. The New York Times. Available at: <https://www.nytimes.com/2007/09/05/books/05comi.html> [Accessed 8 May 2022].
- Nikula, T., Dalton-Puffer, C., Llinares, A., (2013). CLIL Classroom Discourse. *Journal Of Immersion & Content-Based Language Education* 1, 70–100.
- Nixon, M. (2019). Comics and graphic novels. In A. Nash, C. Squires, & I. Willison (Eds.), *The Cambridge History of the Book in Britain* (The Cambridge History of the Book in Britain, 555-564). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9780511862489.023>
- Ogier, S. and Ghosh, K. (2017). Exploring Student Teachers' Capacity for Creativity Through the Interdisciplinary Use Of Comics In The Primary Classroom. *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*, 9(4), 293–309. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21504857.2017.1319871>.
- Pantaleo, S. (2014). "Reading Images in Graphic Novels: Taking Students to a "Greater Thinking Level". *English in Australia* 49(1), 38–51
- Pettitt, J. (2017). Memory and Genocide in Graphic Novels: The Holocaust as Paradigm. *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*, 9(2), 173-186. Taylor & Francis 10.1080/21504857.2017.1355824



- Phoenix, J. (2020). *Maximizing The Impact of Comics In Your Library: Graphic Novels, Manga, And More*. Santa Barbara, California: Libraries Unlimited.
- Piatti-Farnell, L. (2017). 'For God's Sake, Cover Yourself': Sexual Violence, Disrupted Histories, And the Gendered Politics of Patriotism in *Watchmen*. *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*, 8(3), 238–251. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21504857.2017.1307869>.
- Sabbah, M., Masood, M. and Iranmanesh, M. (2013). Effects Of Graphic Novels on Reading Comprehension in Malaysian Year 5 Students. *Journal of Graphic Novels & Comics*, 4(1), 146–160. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21504857.2012.757246>.
- Sabeti, S. (2012). Reading Graphic Novels in School: Texts, Contexts and The Interpretive Work of Critical Reading. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 20(2), 191–210. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14681366.2012.672336>.
- Sabeti, S. (2013). 'A Different Kind of Reading': The Emergent Literacy Practices of a School-Based Graphic Novel Club. *British Educational Research Journal*, 39(5), pp.835–852. <https://doi.org/10.1002/berj.3009>.
- Sacco, J. – (2001). *Palestine. Fantagraphics*, Seattle, Washington, USA
- Schulte, W. & Frederick, N. (2019). Black Panther and Black Agency: Constructing Cultural Nationalism in Comic Books Featuring Black Panther, 1973–1979, *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*, 11(3), 296-314. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21504857.2019.1569081>
- Schwarz, G. (2010). Graphic Novels, New Literacies, And Good Old Social Justice. *The ALAN Review*, 37(3), 71–75. <https://doi.org/10.21061/alan.v37i3.a.10>
- Schwertner, A. (2008). *Motivating Reluctant Readers Through Graphic Novels: An Action Research Project*. Master thesis, Texas Tech University, Lubbock.
- Serafini, F. (2014). *Reading the Visual: An Introduction to Teaching Multimodal Literacy*. Teachers College Press. Available at:

[https://books.google.ad/books/about/Reading\\_the\\_Visual.html?id=kdjMAQAAQBAJ&redir\\_esc=y](https://books.google.ad/books/about/Reading_the_Visual.html?id=kdjMAQAAQBAJ&redir_esc=y) [Accessed 14 Jun. 2022].

- Setyawan, F. H. (2018). The Effectiveness of Using Comic in Teaching Reading Narrative Text. *Journal of English Teaching Adi Buana*, 3(1), 67-75.
- Smith, J.M. and Pole, K. (2018). What's Going on in a Graphic Novel? *The Reading Teacher*, 72(2), 169–177. <https://doi.org/10.1002/trtr.1695>.
- Smith, K. (2005). Is This the End of The Language Class? *The Guardian*. Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/theguardian/2005/jan/21/guardianweekly.guardianweekly1>
- Suender, K. and Piazza, S. (2021). Graphic Novels for Multimodal Learning: Equity for English Learners. *Language Arts Journal of Michigan*, 36(2). <https://doi.org/10.9707/2168-149x.2275>.
- Syma, C., and Weiner, R. (2013). *Graphic Novels and Comics in the Classroom*. Jefferson, NC: McFarland.
- Thomas, Grant (2012). Thinking Inside the Boxes: The Importance of Comics and Graphic Novels In Visual Arts Education. *Visual Arts Research*, 38(1), 64–86. <https://doi.org/10.5406/visuartsrese.38.1.0064>
- Thomas, I. (2022). Reluctant Readers. [online] Oxford Owl for Home. Available at: <https://home.oxfordowl.co.uk/reading/common-reading-issues/reluctant-readers/> [Accessed 10 Jun. 2022].
- U.S. Department of Education. (2000). Office of Educational Research and Improvement. National Center for Education Statistics. Increasing the Participation of Special Needs Students in NAEP: A Report on 1996 NAEP Research Activities, NCES 2000-473, by J. Mazzeo, J. E. Carlson, K. E. Voelkl, & A. D. Lutkus. Washington, DC: 2000.
- Vujovic, A., (2011). Éveil Aux Langues Dans L'enseignement Primaire En Serbie. *Porta Linguarum* 18, 177–190.

William, D. (2018). *Embedded Formative Assessment*. 2nd ed. Bloomington, Indiana Solution Tree Press.

Wiseman, J. (2018). What is Content and Language Integrated Learning? Resources for English Language Learners and Teachers | Pearson English. Available at: <https://www.english.com/blog/content-and-language-integrated-learning/>.

Wong Wai Lap, S., Miao, H. Wing-yi Cheng, R., & Chi Wing Yip, M. (2016). Graphic Novel Comprehension Among Learners with Differential Cognitive Styles and Reading Abilities, *Reading & Writing Quarterly*, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10573569.2016.1216343>